FILED: QUEENS COUNTY CLERK 09/18/2018 03:27 PM

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 59

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 09/18/2018

INDEX NO. 704723/2017

## **EXHIBIT E**

INDEX NO. 704723/2017

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 09/18/2018

1

1	STATE OF NEW YORK
2	SUPREME COURT : COUNTY OF QUEENS
3	
4	TRISTATE CLEANING SOLUTIONS INC.,
5	Plaintiff,
6	-vs- INDEX NO. 704723/2017
7	
8	LANDCO H&L INC.,
9	and BALLY BAO,
10	Defendants,
11	LOUNG CONSTRUCTION INC.,
12	Supplemental Defendant.
13	
14	
15	Examination Before Trial of JOHN SCHENNE,
16	P.E., held before Amanda Virolas, Notary
17	Public, at The Law Office of Thomas Burton,
18	403 Main Street, Suite 716, Buffalo, New York,
19	on Friday, June 1st, 2018 at 1:17 p.m. to 2:22
20	p.m., pursuant to notice.
21	
22	
23	
	DEPAOLO-CROSBY REPORTING SERVICES, INC.

6

1		Schenne & Associates?		
2	A.	Yes.		
3	Q.	Can you describe generally basically for the		
4		last five years or so what primarily type of		
5		work or projects you get involved with?		
6	A.	We design building and sites.		
7	Q.	Okay. Are you familiar with the property		
8		known as 337 Main Street, Buffalo, New York?		
9	~ A.	Yes.		
10	Q.	Do you have a role with respect to developing		
11		that property?		
12	A.	Yes.		
13	Q.	Q. And what is your role?		
14	A.	My current role is the engineer of record.		
15	Q.	That's your current role?		
16	A.	That's my current role.		
17	Q.	And when did you first become familiar with		
18		the 377 Main Street project?		
19	А.	In 2013 there was actually before that,		
20		around 2010 the old owner hired me. They had		
21		some problems with bricks falling off the		
22		building and I helped him design a demolition		

of the 14-story chimney that was on the

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

INDEX NO. 704723/2017

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 09/18/2018

13

- A. I'm the engineer of record, yes.
- Q. The engineer of record. I'm sorry.

And who approached you about becoming president?

- A. That would be Bally Bao.
- Q. Do you know why he wanted you as president as opposed to someone else or himself?
- A. I've got a lot of experience in this industry to get a contracting license. He needed somebody that was knowledgeable about construction or he couldn't get a City license.
- Q. And then what prompted you to leave in September 2017?
  - A. Some illegal activity happened on the job and I'm a person that follows the law and is not associated with illegal activity. Once I found out about it I resigned.
  - Q. Okay. I'll leave the illegal activity to the side for the moment. I'm just interested in trying to gather evidence for my client which is breach of contract.

Are you familiar with a company called

INDEX NO. 704723/2017 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 09/18/2018

21

1 MR. GORMAN: I do. That's not what it 2 says though. 3 4 BY MR. SILVERBERG: 5 Q. Can you explain what you mean by the first 6 sentence here where it says, "piled excessive 7 amounts of the building debris?" 8 They put too many bricks on the roof 9 and the roof fell in. It was an excessive 10 load. 11 You are an engineer and you have your Q. Right. 12 master's in engineering? 13 A. That's correct. Q. Right. So "excessive" would have to be 14 15 relative to the constructional capacity of 16 supporting structure; is that accurate? A. That's accurate. 17 Q. So did you ever do any calculations to 18 19 determine if the load exceeded the capacity of 20 the structure? A. I did not do any calculations. 21 22 Q. So how did you know that the load exceeded the 23 capacity of the structure?

INDEX NO. 704723/2017

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 09/18/2018

23

	:	
1		loads.
2	Q.	Well, that might be true. I don't know if
3		that's true or not true. Until you run your
4		calculations you can't be 100 percent sure; is
5		that accurate?
6	A.	I don't think it is accurate. We're talking
7		in data here. Too many bricks were put on the
8		roof, the roof fell in. I think the
9		approximate cause of the roof falling in was
10		too many bricks on the roof.
11	Q.	Unless you run calculations you don't know
12		exactly how many bricks would it take to
13		undermine the roof especially with safety
14		factors as well; isn't that accurate?
15	A.	I don't think that is accurate.
16		MR. GORMAN: I'll object to the form of
17		the question. It has been asked and answered.
18		
19		BY MR. SILVERBERG:
20	Q.	Let's look at Plaintiff's Number 1 for a
21		moment.
22	A.	Okay.
23	Q.	So the first sentence says, "Please accept

-DEPAOLO-CROSBY REPORTING SERVICES, INC. —

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

INDEX NO. 704723/2017

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 09/18/2018

26

- Q. Now, did Bally Bao report to you as president of Loung what was taking place on a day-to-day basis at the project site?
- A. Not on a day-to-day basis but a couple of times per week.
- Q. Okay. Did Bally Bao inform you that the power pit -- the roof was being removed?
- A. What power pit?
- Q. Power pits.
- 10 A. Parapets.
- Q. Parapets.
  - A. Yes. We had a project meeting a couple of weeks before the parapets were going to be demolished.
    - Q. Did Bally Bao ever inform you that the contract of removing the parapets was putting the parapets debris on top of the roof?
    - A. No. But I told the contractor, your client doing the work, don't put anything on the roof.
    - Q. Okay. Did you provide the contractor with the means to remove the debris from the roof?
    - A. Contractors are responsible for their own

PERTITED NIVERBER 00/10/2010

INDEX NO. 704723/2017

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 09/18/2018

- means and methods whereby, so no, I did not.
- Q. Was there any discussions about the means and methods of removing the debris from the roof?
- A. There was. The contractor had his own little jib crane that he brought out there. I had nothing to do with the jib crane. Again, it falls under the contractor's means and methods. The owner doesn't get involved in that. In this case, the general contractor didn't get involved in those things. Again, the general contractor is not licensed to have anything to do with asbestos and asbestos abatement.
- Q. Was the removal of the parapets considered asbestos abatement?
- A. Yes, it was.
- Q. The parapets contained asbestos?
  - A. The bricks do not. However, years ago and I can't tell you when, somebody smeared plastic roof cement containing asbestos up and down both sides of the parapets. The parapets were four to five feet tall. It was completely contaminated with asbestos and there was not a

-DEPAOLO-CROSBY REPORTING SERVICES, INC. —

INDEX NO. 704723/2017

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 09/18/2018

good way to get the asbestos out of there without spending an exorbitant amount of money.

It seems to me -- I heard a discussion between Tristate and the owner, Bally Bao, about taking the parapets down because it was an easy means of getting rid of the asbestos contaminated bricks.

- Q. Okay. Are you aware at any point in time that the roof was being loaded with the debris from the parapets?
- A. No. I had told the contractor, don't put anything on the roof. If they had told me they were going to load that roof, I would've stopped working the entire job.
- Q. Why is that?
- A. Because the roof is not designed to carry heavy point loads.
  - Q. In this letter going back to Plaintiff's

    Exhibit 2, the second paragraph, it talks

    about brass escalator panels being stolen from
    the job. Do you see that?
  - A. I see that.

-DEPAOLO-CROSBY REPORTING SERVICES, INC. -

INDEX NO. 704723/2017

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 09/18/2018

- Q. When did those alleged thefts take place?
- A. I can't tell you for sure. When an asbestos contractor starts abatement, the job is secured. On this project the gates were locked. The only people allowed in the building are the people who have asbestos cards and certification. There was negative air put in the building. Tristate was the only one that could have people going in and out of that building.

I can't tell you when the panels were stolen, but I can tell you this: They were there before they started and when they were finished they were gone.

- Q. Okay. Is it accurate to say they were stolen in November 2016?
- A. I can't tell you. I didn't go in that job for months. Again, because it was a contaminated area.

Are you aware that there's pictures existing that show the stolen panels in the employee's car?

Q. When did you first become aware that the

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

21

22

23

INDEX NO. 704723/2017

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 09/18/2018

30

## panels were stolen?

- A. We got some clean letters from the third-party asbestos monitor, and the stairwells got cleaned out, and I would guess that that was January, February timeframe. Slowly, slowly, floor by floor we got clean letters. As soon as I got on one of the floors with the escalators I could see that somebody recently had removed the panels. There were still brass sawdust from a saw where the panels had been cut loose from the escalators and stole them.
- Q. And are you aware that Billy Bao took a picture of what he alleged was the panel in the back of someone's truck?
- A. Yes, I saw that picture.
- Do you recall when you saw that picture?
- 18 A. Months after the fact. Had I saw that picture 19 I would have called the police and had 20 somebody arrested.
  - Q. Did you call the police when you did see the picture?
  - A. No.

-DEPAOLO-CROSBY REPORTING SERVICES, INC. –

INDEX NO. 704723/2017

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 09/18/2018

answered all of their questions, and provided directions for what they needed to accomplish, dealt with them on schedule and payments and everything. The kind of question you asked me should really be directed to him.

Q. Give me one second here.

If you don't have this in front of you I can send it to you, but when I asked Mr. Bao at his deposition -- "Who is responsible for making the determination to terminate Tristate?"

Answer from Bally Bao, "John thinks that Tristate didn't do a good job."

- A. It's true Tristate didn't do a good job.
- Q. Why do you say Tristate did not do a good job?
- A. Because there were over 61 federal violations.

  The FBI got called into the job. The criminal investigators for EPA got called in to the job. The DOL criminal investigators got called in to the job. I heard from a DOL employee it was one of the worst messes they've ever uncovered.
- Q. You said there was 61 violations, is that

-DEPAOLO-CROSBY REPORTING SERVICES, INC. –

INDEX NO. 704723/2017

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 09/18/2018

		Page	36
1	J. Bao		•
2	A I'm not sure.		
3	Q The roof that collapsed, was it		
4	made of steel, was it made of wood?		
5	A The entire roof consists of steel		
6	and wood.		
7	Q Where it collapsed, was it at the		
8	point where the roof beam sits on the		
9	concrete, did the concrete or the beams fail;		
10	what caused it to break?		
11	A So there was a wall on the roof		
12	and there was asbestos on the wall, so they		
13	need to remove the asbestos on the wall.		
14	When they removed asbestos, they put it on		
15	the roof, that's why it collapsed.		
16	MR. SILVERBERG: Can you		
17	read back the last question.		
18	(Whereupon, the question was		j
19	read back.)		
20	A So the beam was broken, was		
21	crashed.		
22	Q Did you take any pictures of the		!
23	crushed beam?		
24	A I think I did. So, this is the		
25	crushed beam.		

TransPerfect Legal Solutions 212-400-8845 - Depo@TransPerfect.com

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

INDEX NO. 704723/2017

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 09/18/2018

37

2017. I shut the job down on March 27th, 2017.

- Q. Okay. So --
- A. As soon as I found out there was illegal activity on that job and employees and people on the sidewalk were put at risk for what was going on I closed the job down and notified the DOL.
- Q. You might be familiar with the term "state of mind" because it's kind of in the news lately. On another subject, I'm trying to understand where your state of mind was on March 17th, 2017. What knowledge did you have to justify the termination? You're telling me the FBI didn't show up until afterwards. You didn't really know about the 61 violations until afterwards.

On March 17th, 2017, what did you know? What were you thinking that justified you saying that Tristate was not doing a good job?

A. The roof fell in. The roof fell in and the brass panels got stolen. That to me is enough to say that somebody is not doing a good job.

INDEX NO. 704723/2017
RECEIVED NYSCEF: 09/18/2018

Page 38 1 J. Bao 2 please? 3 MR. SILVERBERG: Can you read back the question? 4 5 (Whereupon, the question was 6 read back.) 7 Α Yes. \*MR. SILVERBERG: I call for 8 9 production of those documents. 10 MR. GORMAN: Please put your 11 requests in writing. We'll take 12 it under advisement. That goes 13 for any request for documents 14 made during the deposition. 15 Q You claim that Tristate was 16 responsible for copper that went missing from 17 the escalator; is that accurate? 18 Α Yes. 19 0 Why do you say that Tristate is 20 responsible for that? Because I witnessed that. 21 Α 22 0 Well, describe for us what you 23 witnessed? 24 Previously the copper was at the 25 escalator and the edge of the escalator.

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 09/18/2018

INDEX NO. 704723/2017

39

A. Let me ask you a --

MR. GORMAN: I'm going to object. That's not a question, it doesn't prompt an If there's a question then you can answer. ask it.

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

1

2

3

4

5

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 59

## BY MR. SILVERBERG:

Q. Going back to Plaintiff's Exhibit Number 2, The last sentence says, "The paragraph 1. work has increased project time by a couple of months."

Are you familiar with the term "critical path method?"

- A. Sure.
- Q. Did you ever run a schedule analysis or a critical path method to determine how much of a delay this roof issue caused?
- A. I did not. We received a Stop Work Order from the City of Buffalo and the job was shut down for a couple of months while the roof was short up.
- Q. Was there any reason why the asbestos work couldn't continue on the other floors during

-DEPAOLO-CROSBY REPORTING SERVICES, INC. –

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

INDEX NO. 704723/2017 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 09/18/2018

40

the roof work?

- A. There was a Stop Work Order on the job. work stopped except for emergency showing to make sure nothing else fell down. entire asbestos crew was put on trying to get all the asbestos contaminated bricks off of six-floor roof.
- Q. In this point in time, what's the timeframe You said you left your role as for this? president at the end of March; is that accurate?
- A. That's correct.
  - Q. And so were you involved with the new contract of getting the men to remove the bricks on the roof?
  - A. I'm not sure which men removed the bricks. thought it was Tristate's men who removed the bricks from the roof, that's my recollection.
  - Q. Okay. So after -- go back to Plaintiff's Exhibit 3, if you look at the second bullet point it says, "The roof collapsed on November This third bullet point says that there was theft on November 30th by workers.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

INDEX NO. 704723/2017

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 09/18/2018

43

that were on the roof?

If you look at some of the pictures from the job -- first of all, I have to tell you something. Your client kept the collapse secret from me for two days. We didn't find out about it until two days after the roof fell in, in which time his members over there doing God knows what. So by the time I found out about it and sent my people over there, two days it had collapsed. And I can tell certain things happened in that job when we weren't around. I can tell from the pictures that are available that my man took that the bricks were piled up four, five feet deep.

We think the load from that is 200, 300 per square foot. It's a tremendous load.

MR. SILVERBERG: Can the court reporter read back the last question, please.

(The last question was read.)

THE WITNESS: I don't have any physical calculations, but the bricks were stacked four to five feet tall in these bags. It is my estimation as an engineer with 40 years of

-DEPAOLO-CROSBY REPORTING SERVICES, INC. -

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 09/18/2018

INDEX NO. 704723/2017

44

experience that the load that came off of that was 200 to 300 pounds per square foot.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

1

2

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 59

## BY MR. SILVERBERG:

- Q. You said they were stacked five feet high?
- A. Up to five feet high, yes.
- Q. Did you ever personally witness -- did you personally see these bricks that were stacked five feet high?
- A. No.
- 11 Q. How did you know it was stacked five feet 12 high?
  - A. Because I got pictures that's shown they're stacked five feet high.
    - Q. Was there somebody standing next to the bricks that was five feet high? How can you tell that was five feet high?
    - A. That's what they appear to be from the These pictures were taken from above picture. looking down at the collapsed roof section.
    - Q. As you know it can be five feet high but over what span length of the beam, so you might have five feet high for only two feet of a

23